ORIGINAL



RECEIV AZ CORP COMMISSION DOCKET CONTROL

2017 APR 26 A 10: 15

Arizona Corporation Commission

DOCKETED

APR 2 6 2017

DOCKETED BY

Court S. Rich AZ Bar No. 021290 Rose Law Group pc 2 7144 E. Stetson Drive, Suite 300 Scottsdale, Arizona 85251 Email: CRich@RoseLawGroup.com Direct: (480) 505-3937 4 Attorney for Energy Freedom Coalition of America 5

BEFORE THE ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION

TOM FORESE **CHAIRMAN**

IN THE MATTER OF THE

BOB BURNS COMMISSIONER

DOUG LITTLE COMMISSIONER

ANDY TOBIN COMMISSIONER

BOYD DUNN COMMISSIONER

DOCKET NO. E-01345A-16-0036

DOCKET NO. E-01345A-16-0123

SERVICE COMPANY FOR A HEARING TO DETERMINE THE FAIR

APPLICATION OF ARIZONA PUBLIC

VALUE OF THE UTILITY PROPERTY OF THE COMPANY FOR

RATEMAKING PURPOSES, TO FIX A JUST AND REASONABLE RATE OF

RETURN THEREON, TO APPROVE RATE SCHEDULES DESIGNED TO

DEVELOP SUCH RETURN.

ENERGY FREEDOM COALITION OF AMERICA'S NOTICE OF FILING WITNESS SUMMARY FOR MARK E. GARRETT

IN THE MATTER OF FUEL AND PURCHASED POWER PROCUREMENT AUDITS FOR ARIZONA PUBLIC SERVICE COMPANY.

Energy Freedom Coalition of America ("EFCA") hereby files the attached witness summary for Mark E. Garrett.

Respectfully submitted this 26th day of April, 2017.

/s/ Court S. Rich

Court S. Rich

Attorney for Energy Freedom Coalition of America

25

26

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

27

28

Docket Control Arizona Corporation Commission 1200 W. Washington Street Phoenix, Arizona 85007 I hereby certify that I have this day served a copy of the foregoing document on all parties of record in this proceeding by regular or electronic mail to: Timothy La Sota Arizona Corporation Commission legaldiv@azcc.gov chanis@azcc.gov chanis@azcc.gov chanis@azcc.gov cfitzgerrell@earthjustice.org tford@azcc.gov cfitzgerrell@earthjustice.org cfitzsimmons@azcc.gov cfitzsimmons@azcc.gov cfitzsimmons@azcc.gov cfitzsimmons@azcc.gov cfitzsimmons@azcc.gov cfitzsimmons@azcc.gov cfitzerrell@earthjustice.org dopacefsky@azruco.gov eabinal@azcc.gov abinal@azcc.gov abinal@azcc.g	1	Original and 13 copies filed on this 26th day of April, 2017 with:	
Arizona Corporation Commission 1200 W. Washington Street Phoenix, Arizona 85007 I hereby certify that I have this day served a copy of the foregoing document on all parties of record in this proceeding by regular or electronic mail to: Timothy La Sota Arizona Corporation Commission Balance Copy Commission Copy Commission Balance Copy Commission Balance Copy Commission Copy Commission Balance Copy Commission C	2	Docket Control	
1200 W. Washington Street Phoenix, Arizona 85007	3		
Phoenix, Arizona 85007			
I hereby certify that I have this day served a copy of the foregoing document on all parties of record in this proceeding by regular or electronic mail to: Timothy La Sota ezuckerman@swenergy.org baatz@accee.org legaldiv@azcc.gov briana@votesolar.org cosuala@earthjustice.org wancleve@azcc.gov dbender@earthjustice.org dbender@earthjustice.org cfitzgerrell@earthjustice.org efitzgerrell@earthjustice.org efitzgerrell@earthjus	4	The state of the s	
record in this proceeding by regular or electronic mail to: Timothy La Sota Arizona Corporation Commission legaldiv@azcc.gov chanis@azcc.gov wancleve@azcc.gov cthord@azcc.gov cfitzsimmons@azcc.gov cfitzsimmons@azcc.gov cfitzsimmons@azcc.gov christine@azcc.gov dpozefsky kchristine@azcc.gov abinah@azcc.gov abinah@azcc.gov abinah@azcc.gov Anthony Wanger Alan Kierman IO DATA CENTERS, LLC t@io.com akierman@io.com Meghan Grabel OSBORN MALEDON, PA mgrabel@omlaw.com gyaquinto@arizonaic.org Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. plack@fclaw.com plack@fclaw.com plack@fclaw.com plack@fclaw.com plack@fclaw.com craig Marks AURA w6345789@yahoo.com Timothy La Sota ezuckerman@swenergy.org bhaatz@acce.org bhaatz@ace.org bhaatz@ace.org bhaatz@acce.org bhaatz@ace.org bhaatz@acce.org bhaatz@ace.org bhaatz@ace.or	5	Control Contro	
Timothy La Sota			
Timothy La Sota Arizona Corporation Commission legaldiv@azcc.gov	0	record in this proceeding by regular or electron	nic mail to:
Arizona Corporation Commission legaldiv@azcc.gov briana@votesolar.org chanis@azcc.gov cosuala@earthjustice.org dbender@earthjustice.org cfitzgerrell@earthjustice.org evanepps@azcc.gov cosuala@earthjustice.org cfitzgerrell@earthjustice.org cfitzgerrell@earthjustice.org evanepps@azcc.gov cfitzsimmons@azcc.gov RUCO mscott@azcc.gov dpozefsky@azruco.gov eabinah@azcc.gov dpozefsky@azruco.gov eabinah@azcc.gov dpozefsky@azruco.gov eabinah@azcc.gov Thomas.com Anthony Wanger pferreact@mac.com IO DATA CENTERS, LLC tficio.com Pinnacle West Capital Corp. akierman@io.com Thomas.loquvam@pinnaclewest.com Meghan Grabel Greg Eisert OSBORN MALEDON, PA mgrabel@onlaw.com grageisert@gmail.com steven.puck@cox.net Meghan Grabel Greg Eisert Pluck mgrabel@onlaw.com gregeisert@gmail.com steven.puck@cox.net Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. Richard Gayer palack@fclaw.com gragered.com.net Warren Woodward AURA craig Marks AURA w6345789@yahoo.com craig.marks@azbar.org pat.quinn47474@gmail.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI John William Moore, Jr. troger lmoore@mbmblaw.com	7	Timothy La Sota	ezuckerman@swenergy.org
chanis@azcc.gov wvancleve@azcc.gov tford@azcc.gov cfitzgerrell@earthjustice.org tford@azcc.gov cfitzsimmons@azcc.gov cabinah@azcc.gov Patricia Ferre Anthony Wanger Alan Kierman IO DATA CENTERS, LLC t@io.com akierman@io.com Meghan Grabel OSBORN MALEDON, PA mgrabel@omlaw.com gyaquinto@arizonaic.org Craig Eisert OSBORN MALEDON, PA mgrabel@omlaw.com gyaquinto@arizonaic.org Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. pblack@fclaw.com khiggins@energystrat.com Warren Woodward Warren Woodward Warren Woodward Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org y dbender@earthjustice.org dbender@earthjustice.org dbender@arthjustice.org dbender@arthjustice.org cfitzgerrell@earthjustice.org cfitzgerell@earthjustice.org cfitzgerell@earthju	8		
tchains@acc.gov dbender@arthjustice.org tford@azcc.gov cfitzgerrell@earthjustice.org dbender@earthjustice.org cfitzgerrell@earthjustice.org cfitzgerrell@earthjustice.org evanepps@azcc.gov cfitzsimmons@azcc.gov RUCO mscott@azcc.gov dpozefsky@azruco.gov eabinah@azcc.gov dpozefsky@azcc.gov dpozefsky@	8	1.7	
tford@azcc.gov cfitzgerrell@earthjustice.org evanepps@azcc.gov cfitzsimmons@azcc.gov RUCO mscott@azcc.gov dpozefsky@azruco.gov eabinah@azcc.gov eabinah@azcc.gov Anthony Wanger Alan Kierman IO DATA CENTERS, LLC t@io.com Pinnacle West Capital Corp. akierman@io.com Thomas.loquvam@pinnaclewest.com Meghan Grabel OSBORN MALEDON, PA Steven Puck mgrabel@omlaw.com gyaquinto@arizonaic.org gregeisert@gmail.com steven.puck@cox.net Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. pblack@fclaw.com rgayer@cox.net khiggins@energystrat.com Warren Woodward AURA w6345789@yahoo.com craig.marks@azbar.org pat.quinn47474@gmail.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org jmoore@mbmblaw.com paniel Pozefsky RUCO mRUCO maxer perfereact@mac.com Alan Kierman Greg Eisert Steven Puck mgrabel@onlaw.com steven.puck@cox.net Sun City Homeowners Association gregeisert@gmail.com Sun City Homeowners Association gregeisert@gmail.com Sun City Homeowners Association gregeisert@gmail.com Steven.puck@cox.net AURA Craig Marks AURA W6345789@yahoo.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org jmoore@mbmblaw.com	9	chanis@azcc.gov	cosuala@earthjustice.org
tford@azcc.gov evanepps@azcc.gov cfitzsimmons@azcc.gov kchristine@azcc.gov mscott@azcc.gov eabinah@azcc.gov eabinah@azcc.gov eabinah@azcc.gov eabinah@azcc.gov eabinah@azcc.gov eabinah@azcc.gov eabinah@azcc.gov eabinah@azcc.gov Patricia Ferre Anthony Wanger Alan Kierman IO DATA CENTERS, LLC t@io.com akierman@io.com Meghan Grabel OSBORN MALEDON, PA mgrabel@omlaw.com gyaquinto@arizonaic.org Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. pblack@fclaw.com khiggins@energystrat.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org Daniel Pozefsky RUCO Patricia Ferre pferreact@mac.com RUCO Thomas Loquvam pinnacle West Capital Corp. Thomas.loquvam@pinnaclewest.com Steven Puck Bisert Steven Puck Steven Puck Steven Puck Steven Puck Richard Gayer rgayer@cox.net Craig Marks AURA AURA AURA AURA Stoger pat.quinn47474@gmail.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org jmoore@mbmblaw.com	10	wvancleve@azcc.gov	dbender@earthjustice.org
cfitzsimmons@azcc.gov kchristine@azcc.gov mscott@azcc.gov dpozefsky@azruco.gov eabinah@azcc.gov 14 15 Anthony Wanger pferreact@mac.com Alan Kierman 16 IO DATA CENTERS, LLC Thomas Loquvam 17 in the price of t	10		cfitzgerrell@earthjustice.org
kchristine@azcc.gov mscott@azcc.gov eabinah@azcc.gov eabinah@azcc.gov eabinah@azcc.gov Patricia Ferre pferreact@mac.com Anthony Wanger Alan Kierman IO DATA CENTERS, LLC t@io.com akierman@io.com Thomas.loquvam@pinnaclewest.com Meghan Grabel OSBORN MALEDON, PA mgrabel@omlaw.com gyaquinto@arizonaic.org Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. pblack@fclaw.com khiggins@energystrat.com Patrick Black TENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. problack@fclaw.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org kchristine@azcc.gov dpozefsky@azruco.gov dpozefsky@azruco.gov dpozefsky@azruco.gov dpozefsky@azruco.gov dpozefsky@azruco.gov dpozefsky@azruco.gov dpozefsky@azruco.gov eabinah@azcc.gov Patricia Ferre pferreact@mac.com Thomas Loquvam Pinnacle West Capital Corp. Thomas.loquvam@pinnaclewest.com Sun City Homeowners Association gregeisert@gmail.com steven.puck@cox.net Craig Marks AURA AURA Craig.marks@azbar.org pat.quinn47474@gmail.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org jmoore@mbmblaw.com	11		
mscott@azcc.gov eabinah@azcc.gov eabinah@azcc.gov Anthony Wanger Alan Kierman IO DATA CENTERS, LLC t@io.com akierman@io.com Meghan Grabel OSBORN MALEDON, PA mgrabel@omlaw.com gyaquinto@arizonaic.org Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. pblack@felaw.com khiggins@energystrat.com Marren Woodward w6345789@yahoo.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org kntocod patricia Ferre pferreact@mac.com Thomas.Loquvam pinnacle West Capital Corp. Thomas.loquvam@pinnaclewest.com Thomas.loquvam@pinnaclewest.com Sun City Homeowners Association gregeisert@gmail.com steven.puck@cox.net RCCC Pinter Patrick Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. pblack@felaw.com khiggins@energystrat.com Craig Marks AURA v6345789@yahoo.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org imoore@mbmblaw.com	12		•
eabinah@azcc.gov Patricia Ferre Anthony Wanger Alan Kierman IO DATA CENTERS, LLC t@io.com Pinnacle West Capital Corp. Thomas Loquvam@pinnaclewest.com Meghan Grabel OSBORN MALEDON, PA mgrabel@omlaw.com gyaquinto@arizonaic.org Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. pblack@fclaw.com khiggins@energystrat.com Warren Woodward Warren Woodward Warren Woodward Timothy Hogan ACLPI Thomas Loquvam Pinnacle West Capital Corp. Thomas.loquvam@pinnaclewest.com Steven Puck Steven Puck Steven Puck Steven.puck@cox.net Richard Gayer rgayer@cox.net Craig Marks AURA AURA Craig Marks AURA Timothy Hogan ACLPI Thomas Loquvam Pinnacle West Capital Corp. Richard Gayer rgayer@cox.net Craig Marks AURA Timothy Hogan ACLPI Thomas Loquvam Pinnacle West Capital Corp. Richard Gayer rgayer@cox.net Craig Marks AURA Steven Puck Stev	12	마이를 20-200 전 보다 있다. 전 전 전 전 전 보고 하는 10 전 전 보고 있다. 10	
Patricia Ferre Anthony Wanger Alan Kierman 10 DATA CENTERS, LLC t@io.com Akierman@io.com 11 Meghan Grabel OSBORN MALEDON, PA mgrabel@omlaw.com gyaquinto@arizonaic.org 12 Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. pblack@fclaw.com thiggins@energystrat.com 24 Warren Woodward w6345789@yahoo.com 26 Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org Patricia Ferre pferreact@mac.com Pinnacle West Capital Corp. Thomas Loquvam Pinnacle West C	13	[N & 1977] Ref. 157.	dpozefsky@azruco.gov
Anthony Wanger Alan Kierman 10 DATA CENTERS, LLC t@io.com akierman@io.com 18 Meghan Grabel OSBORN MALEDON, PA mgrabel@omlaw.com 20 gyaquinto@arizonaic.org 21 Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. pblack@fclaw.com khiggins@energystrat.com 23 Warren Woodward w6345789@yahoo.com 24 Warren Woodward Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org pinnacle West Capital Corp. Thomas Loquvam Pinnacle West Capital Corp. Steven Puck Byer Greg Eisert Steven Puck Steven Puck Steven Puck Steven Puck Steven Puck Greg Eisert Steven Puck Steven Puck FERNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. Richard Gayer rgayer@cox.net Craig Marks AURA AURA Varren Woodward AURA Timothy Hogan ACLPI Thomas Loquvam Pinnacle West Capital Corp. Thomas Loquvam Pinnacle West Capital		eabinah@azcc.gov	n and a
Alan Kierman IO DATA CENTERS, LLC t@io.com akierman@io.com Meghan Grabel OSBORN MALEDON, PA mgrabel@omlaw.com gyaquinto@arizonaic.org Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. pblack@fclaw.com khiggins@energystrat.com Warren Woodward w6345789@yahoo.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI Thomas Loquvam Pinnacle West Capital Corp. Thomas.loquvam@pinnaclewest.com Steven Puck Sun City Homeowners Association gregeisert@gmail.com steven.puck@cox.net Richard Gayer rgayer@cox.net Craig Marks AURA AURA AURA Craig.marks@azbar.org pat.quinn47474@gmail.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI Thomas Loquvam Finnacle West Capital Corp. Thomas Loquvam Pinnacle West Capital Corp. Thomas.loquvam@pinnaclewest.com Telescopt Steven Puck Sun City Homeowners Association gregeisert@gmail.com steven.puck@cox.net Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. Patrick Black FENNEMO	14	Anthony Woncon	
IO DATA CENTERS, LLC t@io.com akierman@io.com Meghan Grabel OSBORN MALEDON, PA mgrabel@omlaw.com gyaquinto@arizonaic.org Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. pblack@fclaw.com khiggins@energystrat.com Warren Woodward w6345789@yahoo.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI Thomas Loquvam Pinnacle West Capital Corp. Thomas.loquvam@pinnaclewest.com Sun City Homeowners Association gregeisert@gmail.com steven.puck@cox.net Richard Gayer rgayer@cox.net Craig Marks AURA Craig Marks AURA craig.marks@azbar.org pat.quinn47474@gmail.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org jmoore@mbmblaw.com	15		prerreact@mac.com
t@io.com akierman@io.com Meghan Grabel OSBORN MALEDON, PA mgrabel@omlaw.com gyaquinto@arizonaic.org Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. pblack@fclaw.com khiggins@energystrat.com Warren Woodward w6345789@yahoo.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org Meghan Grabel Greg Eisert Steven Puck Steven Puck Sun City Homeowners Association gregeisert@gmail.com steven.puck@cox.net Richard Gayer rgayer@cox.net Craig Marks AURA AURA Warren Woodward w6345789@yahoo.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org Pinnacle West Capital Corp. Thomas.loquvam@pinnaclewest.com Steven Puck Steven Puck Steven Puck Richard Gayer rgayer@cox.net AURA rgayer@cox.net Variant Marks AURA Steven Puck Steve		[마음() [사실 () 가입() [1] [1] [1] [1] [1] [1] [1] [1	Thomas Loguyam
akierman@io.com Thomas.loquvam@pinnaclewest.com Meghan Grabel OSBORN MALEDON, PA mgrabel@omlaw.com gyaquinto@arizonaic.org Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. pblack@fclaw.com khiggins@energystrat.com Craig Marks Warren Woodward w6345789@yahoo.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org Meghan Grabel Greg Eisert Steven Puck Steven Puck Sun City Homeowners Association gregeisert@gmail.com Craig Marks AURA AURA craig.marks@azbar.org pat.quinn47474@gmail.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org jmoore@mbmblaw.com	16	2	
Meghan Grabel OSBORN MALEDON, PA mgrabel@omlaw.com gyaquinto@arizonaic.org Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. pblack@fclaw.com khiggins@energystrat.com Warren Woodward w6345789@yahoo.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org Meghan Grabel Greg Eisert Steven Puck Steven Puck Steven Puck Steven Puck Richard Gayer gregeisert@gmail.com steven.puck@cox.net Varien Gayer rgayer@cox.net Craig Marks AURA AURA Varien Woodward Varien Woodward Varien Woodward Varien Woodward Varien Greg Eisert Steven Puck Steven Puc	17		
OSBORN MALEDON, PA mgrabel@omlaw.com gyaquinto@arizonaic.org Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. pblack@fclaw.com khiggins@energystrat.com Warren Woodward w6345789@yahoo.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org Richard Gayer rgayer@cox.net Craig Marks AURA AURA AURA Craig.marks@azbar.org pat.quinn47474@gmail.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org John William Moore, Jr. Kroger jmoore@mbmblaw.com			r nomao.roqu vam@primaere w est.com
OSBORN MALEDON, PA mgrabel@omlaw.com gyaquinto@arizonaic.org Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. pblack@fclaw.com khiggins@energystrat.com Warren Woodward w6345789@yahoo.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. Richard Gayer rgayer@cox.net Craig Marks AURA craig.marks@azbar.org pat.quinn47474@gmail.com Kroger jmoore@mbmblaw.com	18	Meghan Grabel	Greg Eisert
gyaquinto@arizonaic.org gregeisert@gmail.com steven.puck@cox.net Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. Richard Gayer pblack@fclaw.com rgayer@cox.net Warren Woodward w6345789@yahoo.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org gregeisert@gmail.com Richard Gayer rgayer@cox.net All All All All All All All All All Al	19	OSBORN MALEDON, PA	Steven Puck
21 Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. pblack@fclaw.com 23 Kniggins@energystrat.com 24 Warren Woodward 25 w6345789@yahoo.com 26 Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org 27 Kroger 28 ken.wilson@westernresources.org 28 patrick@gins@cox.net Richard Gayer rgayer@cox.net Richard Gayer rgayer@cox.net AURA Craig Marks AURA craig.marks@azbar.org pat.quinn47474@gmail.com Kroger jmoore@mbmblaw.com	1200	mgrabel@omlaw.com	Sun City Homeowners Association
Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. pblack@fclaw.com khiggins@energystrat.com Craig Marks Warren Woodward w6345789@yahoo.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org Richard Gayer rgayer@cox.net Richard Gayer rgayer@cox.net Varial Marks AURA AURA Trinothy Hogan ACLPI Timothy Hogan ACLPI Thogan@aclpi.org Kroger John William Moore, Jr. John William Moore, Jr. Kroger John William Moore, Jr. Kroger John William Moore, Jr. John William Moore, Jr. Kroger John William Moore, Jr. John William Moore, Jr. Kroger	20	gyaquinto@arizonaic.org	
Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C. pblack@fclaw.com khiggins@energystrat.com Craig Marks Warren Woodward w6345789@yahoo.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org Richard Gayer rgayer@cox.net AURA Craig Marks AURA craig.marks@azbar.org pat.quinn47474@gmail.com Kroger jmoore@mbmblaw.com	21		steven.puck@cox.net
pblack@fclaw.com khiggins@energystrat.com Craig Marks AURA Warren Woodward w6345789@yahoo.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org rgayer@cox.net Craig Marks AURA craig.marks@azbar.org pat.quinn47474@gmail.com Kroger jmoore@mbmblaw.com			
khiggins@energystrat.com Craig Marks AURA w6345789@yahoo.com Craig Marks AURA craig.marks@azbar.org pat.quinn47474@gmail.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org khiggins@energystrat.com Craig Marks AURA pat.quinn47474@gmail.com Kroger jmoore@mbmblaw.com	22		
Craig Marks Warren Woodward w6345789@yahoo.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org Craig Marks AURA craig.marks@azbar.org pat.quinn47474@gmail.com John William Moore, Jr. Kroger jmoore@mbmblaw.com	23		rgayer@cox.net
Warren Woodward w6345789@yahoo.com craig.marks@azbar.org pat.quinn47474@gmail.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org John William Moore, Jr. Kroger jmoore@mbmblaw.com	23	kniggins@energystrat.com	Cusia Maulsa
w6345789@yahoo.com craig.marks@azbar.org pat.quinn47474@gmail.com Timothy Hogan ACLPI thogan@aclpi.org ken.wilson@westernresources.org John William Moore, Jr. Kroger jmoore@mbmblaw.com	24	Warran Woodward	
26 Timothy Hogan 27 ACLPI John William Moore, Jr. thogan@aclpi.org Kroger 28 ken.wilson@westernresources.org jmoore@mbmblaw.com	25		
Timothy Hogan ACLPI John William Moore, Jr. thogan@aclpi.org Kroger ken.wilson@westernresources.org jmoore@mbmblaw.com	23	1 100 10 70700 yanoo.com	
ACLPI John William Moore, Jr. thogan@aclpi.org Kroger jmoore@mbmblaw.com	26	Timothy Hogan	Pandamiri
thogan@aclpi.org Kroger ken.wilson@westernresources.org jmoore@mbmblaw.com	27	[[] [[- 1]	John William Moore, Jr.
28 ken.wilson@westernresources.org jmoore@mbmblaw.com	21		
	28		
		schlegelj@aol.com	9245

- 1		
-, 1	Al Gervenack	Greg Patterson
1	Rob Robbins	Munger Chadwick
2	Property Owners & Residents Assoc.	greg@azcpa.org
	al.gervenack@porascw.org	
3	rob.robbins@porascw.org	Nicholas Enoch
		Kaitlyn Redfield-Ortiz
4	Cynthia Zwick	Emily Tornabene
5	Kevin Hengehold	Lubin & Enoch PC
3	ACCA	nick@lubinandenoch.com
6	czwick@azcaa.org	mekastaomanaeneen.eem
	khengehold@azcaa.org	Scott Wakefield
7	Kilciigelioidi@azeaa.org	Hienton Curry, PLLC
	Jay Moyes	swakefield@hclawgroup.com
8	Moyes Sellers & Hendricks LTD	
9	1 	mlougee@hclawgroup.com
	jasonmoyes@law-msh.com	stephen.chriss@wal-mart.com
10	jimoyes@law-msh.com	greg.tillman@wal-mart.com
	jim@harcuvar.com	chris.hendrix@wal-mart.com
11	Was District	A 11 color and A colored
12	Kurt Boehm	Albert H. Acken
1.2	Jody Kyler Cohn	Samuel L. Lofland
13	Boehm Kurtz & Lowry	Ryley Carlock & Applewhite
	kboehm@bkllawfirm.com	ssweeney@rcalaw.com
14	jkylercohn@bkllawfirm.com	aacken@rcalaw.com
15	55 \$76501 W 159	slofland@rcalaw.com
13	Lawrence V. Robertson, Jr.	
16	Noble Americas Energy Solutions LLC	Jeffrey J. Woner
7 = 7655	tubaclawyer@aol.com	K.R. Saline & Associates
17		jjw@krsaline.com
10	Michael Patten	
18	Jason Gellman	Denis Fitzgibbons
19	Snell & Wilmer LLP	Fitzgibbons Law Offices, PLC
	mpatten@swlaw.com	denis@fitzgibbonslaw.com
20	jgellman@swlaw.com	11 19 18 19 18 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19
	docket@swlaw.com	Thomas A. Jernigan
21	bcarroll@tep.com	Andrew Unsicker
22	Charles Wesselhoft	Federal Executive Agencies
	Pima County Attorney's Office	thomas.jernigan.3@us.af.mil
23	charles.wesselhoft@pcao.pima.gov	ebony.payton.ctr@us.af.mil
		andrew.unsicker@us.af.mil
24	Tom Harris	<u></u>
25	AriSEIA	John B. Coffman
23	tom.harris@ariseia.org	john@johncoffman.net
26		journeyjourne
	Giancarlo Estrada	Ann-Marie Anderson
27	Kamper Estrada LLP	Wright Welker & Pauole, PLC
28	gestrada@lawphx.com	aanderson@wwpfirm.com
20	Sestada@iawpiix.com	aallen@wwpfirm.com
		aanencow wpmm.com

1	Steve Jennings
2	AARP Arizona
3	sjennings@aarp.org
4	Garry D. Hays ASDA
5	ghays@lawgdh.com
6	Robert L. Pickels, Jr.
7	Sedona City Attorney's Office rpickels@sedonaaz.gov
8	
9	Jason Pistiner Singer Pistiner PC
10	jp@singerpistiner.com
11	kfox@kfwlaw.com kcrandall@eq-research.com
12	Thomas E. Stewart
13	Granite Creek Power & Gas LLC
14	Granite Creek Farms LLC tom@gcfaz.com
15	Timothy J. Sabo
16	Snell & Wilmer, LLP tsabo@swlaw.com
17	jhoward@swlaw.com
18	pwalker@conservamerica.org
19	
20	
21	By: Hopi L. Slaughter
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	

Mark Garrett Testimony Summary

April 3, 2017 Testimony

In Section 20.5 of the Settlement Agreement the parties agreed to litigate the issue of alternative rate design for large commercial and industrial customers independent of the Agreement. I offer my testimony for the purpose of addressing this issue as it pertains to the Large General Service ("LGS") rate classes. APS' existing LGS rates feature a demand ratchet mechanism. This mechanism discourages energy efficiency by effectively creating a fixed charge that eliminates energy storage as an option for LGS customers. I recommend that APS be directed to create a new optional rate for LGS storage customers that does not include a demand ratchet mechanism.

The demand ratchet mechanism enables APS to bill a customer based on that customer's demand during previous months and not necessarily their demand during the current month. This sends faulty price signals. Under APS's LGS ratchet, a customer has no economic incentive to reduce demand to lower than 80% of the previous 12 month's usage.

A demand ratchet significantly reduces the economic incentives associated with storage technologies. For example, commercial customers with storage who reduce demand peaks to less than 80% of the customer's May-October summer peak will not realize savings for the following 12 months due to the ratchet. The risk of having a years' worth of potential savings eliminated by one adverse 15-minute interval is too high for potential storage customers and those financing storage projects to bear. Even if customers could achieve perfect permanent demand reduction, the lag of one year to realize benefits is significant for a technology that generally has a 10-year life. Customers are less likely to invest in storage if they cannot realize the economic benefits. APS's existing ratchet is simply not conducive to the adoption of storage, and adoption will be further thwarted with the continuation of a ratchet in the LGS rate.

APS has also proposed to maintain the declining block rate design currently used in its LGS classes. This rate design does not send an appropriate signal to customers to reduce demand, as customers are charged a lower rate for higher demand, and as such, it is contrary to Commission policy.

I recommend that the Commission direct APS to change the declining block structure of the demand charge to a flat rate design for the non-ratcheted LGS rate option. APS's LGS TOU rate also features an off-peak demand rate, which is not justified. Peak demand drives costs for ratepayers, so shifting demand to off-peak periods should be incentivized.

April 17, 2017 Testimony

APS witness Charles Miessner recommended continued use of demand ratchets in LGS classes in his direct testimony. Mr. Miessner defends the use of demand ratchets from a cost recovery perspective instead of a price signal perspective, but I believe that both goals can be achieved through better rate design.

Mr. Miessner provided several examples of how he believes a single customer would not pay its cost of service absent a demand ratchet. The examples he provided were based on several false premises: (1) that grid costs are upgraded to serve one specific customer (2) that this specific customer actually pays for only those upgrade costs, (3) that EFCA is proposing to eliminate the demand ratchets for the class,

(4) that other customers would object if the ratchets were eliminated, and (5) that ratchets are necessary to fully recover the costs of the system.

In reality, the system is almost never upgraded to serve one specific customer. It would be impractical to add 1,000 kW of generation capacity, or a 1,000 kW transmission line, or a 1,000 kW substation each time a new, individual, 1 MW customer comes onto the system. Instead, grid upgrade costs are socialized among all customers in the class. It is very rare, but there may be times when grid upgrades are made for one specific customer, however, in that event the customer will generally pay for the upgrade through a customer advance or Contribution in Aid of Construction ("CIAC"). More importantly, production capacity is virtually never expanded for just one customer.

Mr. Miessner's examples assume that the customer pays exclusively for its specific grid upgrade costs. If this were the case, the customer in his examples would pay lower costs year after year as the customer's specific investment levels decrease each year through depreciation recoveries. However, this is not how ratemaking actually works, and system costs are socialized among all class members. So, instead of costs going down each year as the upgrade costs for a specific customer are recovered, costs remain the same, or usually increase, as new investments for other customers are added to the system, and the costs of these additions are spread among all customers in the class.

It is inaccurate to say that EFCA is recommending that demand ratchets be eliminated for the entire class because EFCA's recommendation is to provide an option to the demand ratchet for storage customers. Also, it is very unlikely that any other customers would object to the removal of demand ratchets for storage customers. Ratchets are installed for the benefit of the utility, not the customer. Finally, it is inaccurate to suggest that demand ratchets are necessary to fully recover costs in the LGS classes because APS has only had the ratchet mechanism in place in these classes since 2012, so prior to that time the costs of the LGS classes were recovered without the use of ratchets.

In my testimony I developed revenue-neutral LGS storage rates using data provided by the Company. My rates eliminated the ratchets, the declining blocks and the off-peak demand charges. These rates remove the artificial barriers to storage that now exist in the LGS rates. Moreover, since these rates are revenue-neutral, they do not provide an incentive to the storage customers; they only eliminate the disincentives that now exist.

Finally, I point out that this Commission has recognized that storage is an important and promising technology that will benefit the entire system by displacing expensive resource additions.